

Ambient Air Pollution and Stroke

Petter L. Ljungman, MD, PhD; Murray A. Mittleman, MD, DrPH

Stroke is a leading cause of death in the United States¹ and worldwide (<http://www.who.int>) and may lead to considerable neurological sequelae including aphasia, paraplegia, and dementia. The estimated healthcare costs of stroke in the United States exceed \$36 billion per year.¹ A large body of evidence supports the association between ambient air pollution exposure and increased cardiovascular mortality and morbidity,² but only recently have several studies specifically demonstrated an association with increased stroke risk.

Background

Major sources of air pollution include traffic, power plants and in developing countries, biomass combustion. Both particles and gases are emitted through combustion. Particulate matter with aerodynamic diameter $<10\ \mu\text{m}$ (PM_{10}) include ultrafine particles ($\text{PM}_{1.0}$), fine particles ($\text{PM}_{2.5}$), and coarse particles ($\text{PM}_{10-2.5}$). Ultrafine particles are emitted in fresh exhaust and coalesce into $\text{PM}_{2.5}$ within a short time frame. $\text{PM}_{2.5}$ includes both local sources from traffic emissions and domestic heating and regional sources from power plants, biogenic emissions, and traffic, whereas coarse particles are a heterogeneous mixture that include road dust, endotoxins, and suspended crustal matter. CO, NO_2 , NO_x , SO_2 , and ground-level ozone (O_3) are gaseous pollutants emitted as a result of combustion processes. CO is mainly attributed to mobile sources in urban environments, and NO_2 and NO_x are rapidly formed in emissions from combustion sources such as traffic and power plants. The main source of SO_2 is from fossil fuel power plants. Ground-level O_3 is formed as a result of atmospheric reactions of NO_2 with hydrocarbons in the presence of sunlight and is a major constituent of photochemical smog. Several of the mentioned pollutants are regulated based on evidence of adverse health effects.³ Possible mechanistic pathways including induction of oxidative stress, inflammation, atherosclerosis, and autonomic dysregulation have been outlined in detail²⁻⁴ and are beyond the scope of the current review.

This review aims to assess the current evidence on the association of air pollution exposure with incidence of ischemic and hemorrhagic stroke considering long-term and short-term exposure to ambient pollutants.

Long-Term Air Pollution Exposure

Most studies of long-term exposure to air pollution and stroke outcomes have used estimates of exposure at residential address in months to years as a proxy for long-term accumulated individual exposure. Exposure has then been assessed using residential distance to major roadways, measurements from closest available fixed monitor, or advanced modeling of pollutants combining fixed monitoring measurements with land-use data, emissions databases, traffic density counts, and meteorology incorporated into geographical information systems. These geographical information system models can also include population-based data such as average income level and average smoking prevalence.

Long-Term Air Pollution Exposure and Stroke Mortality

Studies considering long-term exposure to air pollution and stroke mortality have reported that living in areas with higher ambient pollution is associated with higher risk of stroke mortality (Table 1). Studies from the United Kingdom^{5,6} and Northwest Florida⁷ contain large administrative databases with cause of death, residence, sex, and area-based data such as socioeconomic status, urbanization, smoking prevalence, and greenness. Living near a main road,⁵ traffic sources,⁷ point sources of emissions,⁷ or higher modeled exposure to PM_{10} , CO, and NO_x ⁶ were all associated with stroke mortality. Several cohort studies have also studied the association between long-term exposure to air pollution and stroke mortality.⁸⁻¹³ These studies have more detailed individual-level data that improve the ability to adjust for potential confounders that may influence the place of residence and the risk of stroke mortality. Strongest associations were reported in the prospective Women's Health Initiative cohort¹¹ that included well-validated outcome assessment. In the Californian residents of the American Cancer Society cohort study,⁹ associations were reported for NO_2 and any stroke mortality and borderline significant associations for $\text{PM}_{2.5}$. In the California Teachers Study,¹⁰ however, higher long-term PM_{10} and $\text{PM}_{2.5}$ exposure were not associated with cerebrovascular mortality. In 232 rural districts of Japan,¹² including 250 stroke

Received June 18, 2014; final revision received September 17, 2014; accepted September 18, 2014.

From the Department of Medicine Cardiovascular Epidemiology Research Unit, Cardiovascular Division, Beth Israel Deaconess Medical Center, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA (P.L.L., M.A.M.); and Unit of Environmental Epidemiology, Institute of Environmental Medicine, Karolinska Institute, Stockholm, Sweden (P.L.L.).

The online-only Data Supplement is available with this article at <http://stroke.ahajournals.org/lookup/suppl/doi:10.1161/STROKEAHA.114.003130/-/DC1>.

Correspondence to Murray A. Mittleman, MD, DrPH, Cardiovascular Epidemiology Research Unit, Cardiovascular Division, Beth Israel Deaconess Medical Center, 375 Longwood Ave, 4th Floor Suite 440, Boston, MA 02215-5395. E-mail mmittlema@bidmc.harvard.edu

(*Stroke*. 2014;45:3734-3741.)

© 2014 American Heart Association, Inc.

Stroke is available at <http://stroke.ahajournals.org>

DOI: 10.1161/STROKEAHA.114.003130

Table 1. Studies of Long-Term Air Pollution Exposure and Stroke Mortality

Study	Location	Study Design	Stroke Outcome	Relative Risk (95% Confidence Intervals)	Exposure
Maheswaran and Elliott ⁵	England and Wales	Ecological	Any stroke	1.05 (1.04–1.07)	Living within 200 m of main road compared with ≥ 1000 m
Maheswaran et al ⁶	Sheffield, UK	Ecological	Any stroke	1.37 (1.19–1.57) PM ₁₀ 1.26 (1.10–1.46) CO 1.33 (1.14–1.56) NO _x	Highest to lowest quintile of modeled pollutant
Hu et al ⁷	Florida, USA	Ecological	Any stroke	1.09 (1.03–1.15)*	Per 10 000 vehicles/d within census tract
Andersen et al ⁸	Denmark	Cohort	Any stroke Ischemic Hemorrhagic	1.22 (1.00–1.50) 1.46 (0.90–2.39) 1.00 (0.76–1.31)	Per interquartile range increase (43%) in mean modeled NO ₂ since 1971
Jerrett et al ⁹	California, USA	Cohort	Any stroke	1.07 (0.99–1.15) PM _{2.5} 1.08 (1.02–1.15) NO ₂ 1.01 (0.92–1.11) O ₃	Per 5.3 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ PM _{2.5} Per 4.12 ppb NO ₂ Per 24.2 ppb O ₃
Lipsett et al ¹⁰	California, USA	Cohort	Any stroke	0.99 (0.89–1.09) PM ₁₀ 1.16 (0.92–1.46) PM _{2.5}	Per 10 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ mean PM ₁₀ 1996–2005 or mean PM _{2.5} 1999–2005
Miller et al ¹¹	36 US cities	Cohort	Any stroke	1.83 (1.11–3.00) PM _{2.5}	Annual mean in 2000 at closest monitor per 10 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$
Ueda et al ¹²	Japan	Cohort	Any stroke	0.86 (0.74–1.01) PM ₁₀	Per 10 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ annual mean at closest monitor
Yorifuji et al ¹³	Shizuoka, Japan	Cohort	Any stroke Ischemic Hemorrhagic	1.19 (1.06–1.34) 1.20 (1.04–1.39) 1.28 (1.05–1.57)	Per 10 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ annual mean NO ₂

PM₁₀ indicates particles with aerodynamic diameter ≤ 10 μm ; PM_{2.5}, fine particles with aerodynamic diameter ≤ 2.5 μm ; and ppb, parts per billion.

*95% credible interval from a Bayesian analysis.

deaths, higher long-term PM₁₀ exposure was not associated with stroke mortality. Specific characterization of stroke into types and subtypes was available in 2 studies: in Shizuoka, Japan¹³ and in Denmark.⁸ Yorifuji et al¹³ reported associations between NO₂ and mortality from ischemic stroke and intracerebral hemorrhage but not subarachnoid hemorrhage. Andersen et al⁸ reported borderline significant associations between long-term NO₂ exposure and ischemic stroke but not for hemorrhagic strokes and did not further subtype hemorrhagic strokes.

Long-Term Air Pollution Exposure and Hospitalization for Stroke

In studies of long-term exposure to air pollution and hospitalization for stroke, higher exposure at home addresses was also associated with higher risk of admission for stroke in some studies, but results were less consistent than for stroke mortality (Table 2). Most commonly reported pollutants included long-term exposure to PM₁₀,^{6,10,14,15} PM_{2.5},^{10,11,16} and NO_x.^{6,17,18} or NO₂.^{8,14,15,19,20} Many of the cohort studies reported positive associations,^{8,10,11,14,21} whereas ecological studies^{6,15,19} and case-control studies^{17,18,21} showed mixed results. In a random-effects meta-analysis of 11 European cohorts,¹⁶ long-term PM_{2.5} was associated more strongly with stroke in subjects >60 years old, never-smokers, and among subjects with exposure levels <25 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ (current annual mean air quality standard in Europe). Studies that compared long-term air pollution exposure and hospital admissions according to specific stroke

type reported positive associations for NO₂, CO, and traffic density and admissions for both ischemic and hemorrhagic stroke¹⁹ in Edmonton, Canada, whereas NO₂^{8,20} in Denmark or NO_x¹⁵ in London, UK, demonstrated associations consistent with ischemic stroke but not hemorrhagic stroke. Two studies from Scania, Sweden^{17,18} only including hospital admissions for ischemic stroke observed associations between higher long-term exposure to NO_x and higher risk of hospital admission for ischemic stroke in participants with diabetes mellitus but found no association in the overall population, in smokers, or in participants with hypertension or atrial fibrillation. A recent population-based cohort study in Denmark studying long-term NO₂ and traffic noise exposure and stroke incidence reported positive associations for ischemic stroke in separate analyses for both noise and NO₂ but in combined analyses NO₂ was only associated with fatal ischemic strokes.²⁰

Short-Term Air Pollution Exposure

Day-to-day differences in air pollution exposure in the days preceding stroke are used to study possible triggering effects of air pollution on stroke. In time-series analyses, daily counts of stroke deaths or admissions are compared with air pollution levels on the same day or preceding days in a study region. In case-crossover analyses, exposure levels preceding stroke mortality or hospitalization in an individual are contrasted with control periods within the same calendar month within each individual controlling for season and day of week and perfectly matching time-invariant patient characteristics by design.

Table 2. Studies of Long-Term Air Pollution Exposure and Hospitalization for Stroke

Study	Location	Study Design	Stroke Outcome	Relative Risk (95% Confidence Intervals)	Exposure
Maheswaran et al ⁶	Sheffield, UK	Ecological	Any stroke	1.13 (0.99–1.29) PM ₁₀ 1.11 (0.99–1.25) CO 1.13 (1.04–1.27) NO _x	Highest to lowest quintile of modeled pollutant
Andersen et al ⁸	Denmark	Cohort	Any stroke	1.05 (0.99–1.11)	Per interquartile range increase (43%) in mean modeled NO ₂ since 1971
Lipsett et al ¹⁰	California	Cohort	Any stroke	1.06 (1.00–1.13) PM ₁₀ 1.14 (0.99–1.32) PM _{2.5}	Per 10 µg/m ³ annual mean pollutant at closest monitor
Miller et al ¹¹	36 US cities	Cohort	Any stroke	1.28 (1.01–1.61) PM _{2.5}	Per 10 µg/m ³ mean of closest monitor during 2000
Maheswaran et al ¹⁵	London, UK	Ecological	Ischemic	1.22 (0.77–1.93) PM ₁₀ 1.11 (0.93–1.32) NO ₂	Per 10 µg/m ³ of modeled pollutant exposure
			Hemorrhagic	0.52 (0.20–1.37) PM ₁₀ 0.86 (0.60–1.24) NO ₂	
Atkinson et al ¹⁴	England	Cohort	Any stroke	0.98 (0.95–1.01) PM ₁₀ 0.99 (0.95–1.03) NO ₂ 1.02 (1.00–1.05) SO ₂ 1.00 (0.97–1.04) O ₃	Per 3.0 µg/m ³ PM ₁₀ Per 10.7 µg/m ³ NO ₂ Per 2.2 µg/m ³ SO ₂ Per 3.0 µg/m ³ O ₃ modeled annual mean
Stafoggia et al ¹⁶	11 cohorts, Europe	Cohort	Any stroke	1.19 (0.88–1.62)	Per 5 µg/m ³ annual mean
Oudin et al ¹⁷	Scania, Sweden	Case-control	Ischemic	0.95 (0.86–1.06)	Annual mean modeled NO _x of 20–30 vs <10 µg/m ³
Oudin et al ¹⁸	Scania, Sweden	Case-control	Ischemic	In diabetics: 2.0 (1.2–3.4) high NO _x 1.3 (1.1–1.6) low NO _x	Modeled annual NO _x : High NO _x ≥25 µg/m ³ Low NO _x <15 µg/m ³ Reference: nondiabetics with low NO _x
Johnson et al ¹⁹	Edmonton, Canada	Ecological	Any stroke	1.29 (1.16–1.43)	Highest (16.7–20.3 ppb) to lowest quintile (10.1–14.0 ppb) of NO ₂ exposure
			Nonhemorrhagic	1.36 (1.19–1.56)	
			Hemorrhagic	1.46 (1.19–1.80)	
Sørensen et al ²⁰	Denmark	Cohort	Any stroke	1.08 (1.01–1.16)	Per 10 µg/m ³ annual mean NO ₂
			Ischemic	1.11 (1.03–1.20)	
			Hemorrhagic	1.00 (0.80–1.24)	
Johnson et al ²¹	Edmonton, Canada	Case-control	Any stroke	1.01 (0.94–1.08)	Per 5 ppb NO ₂
			Ischemic	1.03 (0.94–1.13)	
			TIA	0.95 (0.86–1.05)	
			Hemorrhagic	1.07 (0.92–1.24)	

PM₁₀ indicates particles with aerodynamic diameter ≤10 µm; PM_{2.5}, fine particles with aerodynamic diameter ≤2.5 µm; ppb, parts per billion; and TIA, transient ischemic attack.

Several studies have investigated associations between short-term exposure to air pollutants including PM₁₀, PM_{2.5}, CO, NO₂, SO₂, and O₃ and stroke mortality or hospitalizations for stroke in many cities in North America, Europe, and East Asia. Mean levels of pollutants varied considerably between study locations from low-polluted cities such as Dijon, France (daily mean PM₁₀ 20 µg/m³) to highly polluted cities such as Wuhan, China (daily mean PM₁₀ 119 µg/m³).

Short-Term Air Pollution Exposure and Stroke Mortality

A majority of studies investigating short-term exposure to air pollution and stroke mortality have been time-series studies,^{22–36}

the remainder used case-crossover design.^{37–41} A qualitative summary of the studies is provided in Table 3 (for detailed estimates, see Table I in the online-only Data Supplement). Most studies do not differentiate between ischemic and hemorrhagic stroke mortality. Several studies reported associations between short-term exposure to particle matter, including several size fractions, or gases and any stroke mortality. Only a few studies further characterized stroke into ischemic and hemorrhagic stroke mortality.^{24,33–35,38} Short-term exposure to particulate matter and gases was associated with both ischemic stroke and hemorrhagic stroke. In Tokyo,³⁴ the risk increase for subarachnoid hemorrhage mortality per 10 µg/m³ PM_{2.5} or NO₂ was roughly double the risk increase for ischemic or intracerebral

Table 3. Studies of Short-Term Air Pollution Exposure and Stroke Mortality

Study	Location	Study Design	Stroke Outcome	Positive Associations*	Null Associations†
Chen et al ²²	8 Chinese cities	Time series	Any stroke	PM ₁₀ , NO ₂ , and SO ₂	...
Hoek et al ²³	Netherlands	Time series	Any stroke	Black smoke, CO, SO ₂ , and O ₃ .	PM ₁₀ and NO ₂
Hong et al ²⁴	Seoul, Korea	Time series	Ischemic	TSP, CO, NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃	...
			Hemorrhagic	TSP	CO, NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃
Hong et al ²⁵	Seoul, Korea	Time series	Any stroke	PM ₁₀ , CO, NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃	...
Kan et al ²⁶	Shanghai, China	Time series	Any stroke	PM ₁₀ and NO ₂	SO ₂
Kettunen et al ²⁷	Helsinki, Finland	Time series	Any stroke	PM _{2.5} and CO in warm season	PM ₁₀ , coarse PM, PM _{0.1} , NO ₂ , and O ₃ in warm season. No associations in cold season
Li et al ²⁸	Tianjin, Taiwan	Time series	Any stroke	PM ₁₀ on days with >20°C	PM ₁₀ on days with ≤20°C
Qian et al ²⁹	Wuhan, China	Time series	Any stroke	PM ₁₀	...
Qian et al ³⁰	Wuhan, China	Time series	Any stroke	NO ₂	SO ₂ and O ₃
Qian et al ³¹	Wuhan, China	Time series	Any stroke	PM ₁₀ all days and NO ₂ , SO ₂ on normal temperature days	O ₃ all days and NO ₂ , SO ₂ on high temperature days
Qian et al ³²	Wuhan, China	Time series	Any stroke	NO ₂ in spring. PM ₁₀ , NO ₂ , SO ₂ in winter	PM ₁₀ and SO ₂ in spring. All pollutants summer or fall
Turin et al ³³	Takashima, Japan	Time series	Any stroke	...	Suspended PM, NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃
			Ischemic	NO ₂	Suspended PM, SO ₂ , and O ₃
			Hemorrhagic	...	Suspended PM, NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃
Yorifuji et al ³⁴	Tokyo, Japan	Time series	Any stroke	PM _{2.5} and NO ₂	...
			Ischemic	...	PM _{2.5} and NO ₂
			Hemorrhagic	PM _{2.5} and NO ₂	...
Yorifuji and Kashima ³⁵	47 Japanese cities	Time series	Any stroke	...	PM ₁₀
			Ischemic	PM ₁₀	...
			Hemorrhagic	...	PM ₁₀
Zanobetti and Schwartz ³⁶	112 US cities	Time series	Any stroke	PM _{2.5} and PM _{coarse}	...
Maynard et al ³⁷	Massachusetts, USA	Case crossover	Any stroke	Black carbon	SO ₄
Qian et al ³⁸	Shanghai, China	Case crossover	Any stroke	PM ₁₀ , NO ₂ , and SO ₂	...
			Ischemic	PM ₁₀ , NO ₂ , and SO ₂	...
			Hemorrhagic	NO ₂ and SO ₂	PM ₁₀
Ren et al ³⁹	Massachusetts, USA	Case crossover	Any stroke	O ₃	...
Zeka et al ⁴⁰	20 US cities	Case crossover	Any stroke	PM ₁₀	...
Zeka et al ⁴¹	20 US cities	Case crossover	Any stroke	PM ₁₀ if pneumonia or ≥75-y old	PM ₁₀ if no pneumonia or ≤75-y old

PM_{0.1} indicates ultrafine particles with <0.1 µm aerodynamic diameter; PM₁₀, particles with aerodynamic diameter ≤10 µm; PM_{2.5}, fine particles with aerodynamic diameter ≤2.5 µm; PM_{coarse}, coarse particles with aerodynamic diameter between 2.5 and 10 µm in aerodynamic diameter; and TSP, total suspended particles.

*Positive associations with confidence intervals not including the null.

†Associations with confidence intervals including the null.

Table 4. Studies of Short-Term Exposure to Air Pollution and Hospital Admissions for Stroke

Study	Location	Study Design	Stroke Outcome	Positive Associations*	Null Associations†
Ballester et al ⁴³	Valencia, Spain	Time series	Any stroke	NO ₂	CO, SO ₂ , and O ₃
Burnett et al ⁴⁴	Toronto, Canada	Time series	Any stroke	...	PM ₁₀ , CO, NO ₂ , and O ₃
Chan et al ⁴⁵	Taipei, Taiwan	Time series	Any stroke	PM ₁₀ , PM _{2.5} , and O ₃	CO, NO ₂ , and SO ₂
			Ischemic	...	PM ₁₀ , PM _{2.5} , CO, NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃
			Hemorrhagic	...	PM ₁₀ , PM _{2.5} , CO, NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃
Corea et al ⁴⁶	Mantua, Italy	Case crossover	Any stroke	PM ₁₀	...
			Ischemic	PM ₁₀ in all ischemic, large vessel, small vessel, and lacunar	PM ₁₀ in cardioembolic. CO, NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃
Jalaludin et al ⁴⁷	Sydney, Australia	Time series	Any stroke	...	PM ₁₀ , PM _{2.5} , CO, NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃
Larrieu et al ⁴⁸	8 French cities	Time series	Any stroke	...	PM ₁₀ , NO ₂ , and O ₃
Le Tertre et al ⁴⁹	8 European cities	Time series	Any stroke	...	PM ₁₀ and black smoke
Linn et al ⁵⁰	Los Angeles, USA	Time series	Any stroke	CO and NO ₂ in spring	PM ₁₀ and O ₃
Moolgavkar ⁵¹	Los Angeles, USA	Time series	Any stroke	PM ₁₀ , CO, NO ₂ , and SO ₂	PM _{2.5}
Nascimento et al ⁵²	Sao Jose Campos, Brazil	Time series	Any stroke	PM ₁₀ and SO ₂	O ₃
Poloniecki et al ⁵³	London, UK	Time series	Any stroke	...	Black smoke, CO, NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃
Pönkä and Virtanen ⁵⁴	Helsinki, Finland	Time series	Any stroke	NO ₂	...
			Ischemic	Total suspended particles	...
Sunyer et al ⁵⁵	7 European cities	Time series	Any stroke	...	SO ₂
Turin et al ⁵⁶	Takashima, Japan	Time series	Any stroke	...	PM ₁₀ , NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃
			Ischemic	...	PM ₁₀ , NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃
			Hemorrhagic	SO ₂	PM ₁₀ , NO ₂ , and O ₃
Villeneuve et al ⁵⁷	Edmonton, Canada	Case crossover	Any stroke	...	PM ₁₀ , PM _{2.5} , CO, NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃
			Ischemic	PM _{2.5}	CO, NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃
			TIA	...	PM ₁₀ , PM _{2.5} , CO, NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃
			Hemorrhagic	SO ₂	PM ₁₀ , PM _{2.5} , CO, NO ₂ , and O ₃
Villeneuve et al ⁵⁸	Edmonton, Canada	Case crossover	Any stroke	CO in warm season	PM _{2.5} , NO ₂ , SO ₂ , O ₃ , and CO all year
			Ischemic	CO, NO ₂ , O ₃ in warm season	PM _{2.5} , SO ₂ , CO, NO ₂ , and O ₃ all year
			Hemorrhagic	...	PM _{2.5} , CO, NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃
Wong et al ⁵⁹	Hong Kong, China	Time series	Any stroke	...	PM ₁₀ , NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃
Wordley et al ⁶⁰	Birmingham, UK	Time series	Any stroke	PM ₁₀	...
Xiang et al ⁶¹	Wuhan, China	Case crossover	Any stroke	PM ₁₀ and NO ₂ in cold season	PM ₁₀ , NO ₂ , and SO ₂ all year and in subtypes. PM ₁₀ and NO ₂ in warm season
Xu et al ⁶²	Allegheny, USA	Case crossover	Any stroke	O ₃	...
			Ischemic	O ₃	...
			Hemorrhagic	...	O ₃
Yang et al ⁶³	Taipei, Taiwan	Time series	Any stroke	...	Asian dust
			Ischemic	...	Asian dust
			Hemorrhagic	Asian dust and intracerebral	Asian dust and subarachnoidal
Tsai et al ⁶⁴	Kaohsiung, Taiwan	Case crossover	Ischemic	PM ₁₀ , NO ₂ , SO ₂ , O ₃ warm days, CO all days	PM ₁₀ , NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃ cool days
			Hemorrhagic	PM ₁₀ , CO, NO ₂ , and O ₃ warm days	SO ₂ warm days, all pollutants cool days
Wellenius et al ⁶⁵	9 US cities	Case crossover	Ischemic	PM ₁₀ , CO, NO ₂ , and SO ₂	...
			Hemorrhagic	...	PM ₁₀ , CO, NO ₂ , and SO ₂
Lisabeth et al ⁶⁶	Corpus Christi, USA	Time series	Ischemic	PM _{2.5}	O ₃
O'Donnell et al ⁶⁷	8 Canadian cities	Case crossover	Ischemic	PM _{2.5} in diabetics and noncardioembolic	PM _{2.5} in ischemic strokes overall

(Continued)

Table 4. Continued

Study	Location	Study Design	Stroke Outcome	Positive Associations*	Null Associations†
Wellenius et al ⁶⁸	Boston, USA	Case crossover	Ischemic	PM _{2.5} , black carbon, NO ₂ , and PM _{2.5} large and small vessel stroke	CO, SO ₄ , O ₃ , and PM _{2.5} cardioembolic stroke
Henrotin et al ⁶⁹	Dijon, France	Case crossover	Ischemic	O ₃ in all ischemic, large vessel, and TIA	PM ₁₀ , CO, NO ₂ , and SO ₂
Henrotin et al ⁷⁰	Dijon, France	Case crossover	Hemorrhagic		PM ₁₀ , CO, NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃
			Ischemic	O ₃ in recurrent stroke	O ₃ in incident stroke
Yamazaki et al ⁷¹	Japan	Case crossover	Ischemic	...	PM ₇ , NO ₂ , and O ₃ in 24 h averages
			Hemorrhagic	PM ₇ 2 h before intracerebral hemorrhage	...
Bedada et al ⁷²	UK	Case crossover	Minor stroke	NO	CO, NO ₂ , SO ₂ , and O ₃

PM_{0.1} indicates ultrafine particles with less than 0.1 μm aerodynamic diameter; PM₁₀, particles with aerodynamic diameter ≤10 μm; PM_{2.5}, fine particles with aerodynamic diameter ≤2.5 μm; PM_{coarse}, coarse particles with aerodynamic diameter between 2.5 and 10 μm in aerodynamic diameter; and TIA, transient ischemic attack.

*Positive associations with confidence intervals not including the null.

†Associations with confidence intervals including the null.

hemorrhage mortality. It is possible that these hemorrhages may have more precise temporal relationship between air pollution exposure and the timing of stroke onset leading to less exposure misclassification and more precise estimation of the association.⁴² Stronger associations between short-term air pollution exposure and stroke mortality were observed in elderly,^{25,30} women,²⁵ and individuals with a history of diabetes mellitus⁴¹ or cardiac disease³⁸ in some but not all studies.

Short-Term Air Pollution Exposure and Hospitalization for Stroke

Studies of short-term air pollution exposure and hospitalization for any stroke have reported mixed results.^{43–63} However, in contrast to studies investigating short-term exposure to air pollution and stroke mortality that typically use death certificate data, some studies of associations with hospital admissions for stroke have had more data on stroke type. These studies have reported associations between PM₁₀,^{45,46,64,65} PM_{2.5},^{66–68} black carbon,⁶⁸ CO,^{51,58,64} NO₂,^{43,58,64,68} and O₃^{62,69,70} and ischemic stroke (Table 4; for detailed estimates, see Table II in the online-only Data Supplement). A majority did not observe associations between air pollutants and hemorrhagic stroke^{45,58,62,65,69} with a few exceptions^{56,57,63,64,71} including one study that specifically investigated days in Taiwan polluted by Asian dust storms originating from the Gobi desert.⁶³ Of the studies with specific data on subtype of ischemic stroke, PM₁₀, PM_{2.5}, and O₃ were associated with strokes characterized as large-artery atherosclerotic strokes, small-vessel occlusions, lacunar strokes, or transient ischemic attacks rather than cardioembolic strokes.^{46,67–69} Stronger associations were reported for recurrent ischemic strokes or history of stroke,^{58,70} in individuals with diabetes mellitus or on diabetes mellitus medication^{67,70} and with ≥1 cardiovascular risk factors.^{69,70} A few studies reported stronger associations between O₃ and ischemic stroke in men than in women.^{62,69,72} Air pollution on warm days was more strongly associated with both hemorrhagic and ischemic stroke in Taiwan.⁶⁴ Associations between air pollution and ischemic stroke were stronger in the warm season in Edmonton, Canada⁵⁸ and Dijon, France⁷⁰ in contrast to Wuhan⁶¹ where associations

were stronger in the cold season. Differences may reflect better exposure classification because of time spent outdoors in climates such as Edmonton, Canada but may also be because of seasonal interactions between pollutants.

Summary

The current evidence suggests that exposure to higher levels of air pollutants related to combustion increases the risk of stroke. Studies of both long-term and short-term air pollution exposure suggest consistent evidence of increased risk of ischemic stroke and moderately consistent evidence supporting an association with hemorrhagic stroke. A few studies exploring susceptible subgroups have indicated stronger associations in individuals with several cardiovascular risk factors, diabetes mellitus, previous stroke, and of older age. A recently published meta-analysis focusing on short-term air pollution exposure and stroke incidence or mortality reported significant associations for PM_{2.5}, PM₁₀, SO₂, CO, NO₂, and O₃ for stroke with stronger associations for ischemic stroke.⁷³

Because much of the existing literature is based on linkage of administrative data, an important limitation of many available studies is limited ability to classify and validate specific stroke outcomes. Ischemic stroke and hemorrhagic stroke and their subtypes have in the majority of studies been analyzed as a combined outcome despite the clear possibility that air pollution may affect underlying pathophysiological pathways differently. Only some have separately analyzed ischemic stroke and hemorrhagic stroke and a handful have considered subtypes of ischemic stroke or hemorrhagic stroke. Similarly, only a handful used thorough chart reviews and adjudicated the diagnosis and onset time of stroke. This highlights the need for high-quality validated diagnostic characterization of stroke outcome in studies of air pollution. In a study of short-term air pollution exposure and stroke specifically investigating the bias introduced through misclassification of time of event of stroke found that incorrect temporal classification caused up to 66% bias toward the null.⁴² This may be especially relevant in mortality studies where the date of death from death certificates is used while not accounting for the

time between stroke onset and death. In studies of long-term exposure to air pollution, the ability to investigate associations with stroke is dependent on the validity and resolution of the spatial exposure assessment and the adequate control for confounders related to both air pollution at place of residence and the risk of stroke, in particular socioeconomic factors.

There is growing evidence to suggest that both accumulated exposure to higher air pollution during a period of years and higher mean levels during a period of days increase the risk of stroke. In addition to improving temporal classification of exposure by validating stroke onset time, future research efforts should be directed to careful characterization of stroke subtype because air pollution may variably affect the different pathophysiological pathways. Air pollution exposure and increased risk of stroke may represent a considerable public health problem and regulations have improved air quality in many countries in Europe and the United States, resulting in greater life expectancy.⁷⁴ Yet, associations with stroke have been reported at levels in compliance with current standards,^{16,68} highlighting the continued importance of effective regulation and monitoring in high-income countries as well as extending efforts to address regulation in low- and middle-income countries where levels of air pollution and prevalence of stroke are on the rise.

Sources of Funding

This work was supported by the US Environmental Protection Agency (grants R832416, RD83479801), National Institute of Environmental Health Sciences (grant P01-ES009825), Swedish Council for Working Life and Social Research Marie Curie International Postdoctoral Fellowship Programme, the Swedish Heart-Lung Foundation, the Swedish Society of Cardiology, and the Swedish Society for Medical Research. The content is solely the responsibility of the authors and does not necessarily represent the official views of the National Institutes of Health or the Environmental Protection Agency.

Disclosures

None.

References

- Go AS, Mozaffarian D, Roger VL, Benjamin EJ, Berry JD, Borden WB, et al; American Heart Association Statistics Committee and Stroke Statistics Subcommittee. Heart disease and stroke statistics—2013 update: a report from the American Heart Association. *Circulation*. 2013;127:e6–e245.
- Brook RD, Rajagopalan S, Pope CA 3rd, Brook JR, Bhatnagar A, Diez-Roux AV, et al; American Heart Association Council on Epidemiology and Prevention, Council on the Kidney in Cardiovascular Disease, and Council on Nutrition, Physical Activity and Metabolism. Particulate matter air pollution and cardiovascular disease: An update to the scientific statement from the American Heart Association. *Circulation*. 2010;121:2331–2378.
- Brook RD, Franklin B, Cascio W, Hong Y, Howard G, Lipsett M, et al; Expert Panel on Population and Prevention Science of the American Heart Association. Air pollution and cardiovascular disease: a statement for healthcare professionals from the Expert Panel on Population and Prevention Science of the American Heart Association. *Circulation*. 2004;109:2655–2671.
- Mills NL, Törnqvist H, Robinson SD, Gonzalez MC, Söderberg S, Sandström T, et al. Air pollution and atherothrombosis. *Inhal Toxicol*. 2007;19(suppl 1):81–89.
- Maheswaran R, Elliott P. Stroke mortality associated with living near main roads in England and Wales: a geographical study. *Stroke*. 2003;34:2776–2780.
- Maheswaran R, Haining RP, Brindley P, Law J, Pearson T, Fryers PR, et al. Outdoor air pollution and stroke in Sheffield, United Kingdom: a small-area level geographical study. *Stroke*. 2005;36:239–243.

- Hu Z, Liebens J, Rao KR. Linking stroke mortality with air pollution, income, and greenness in northwest Florida: an ecological geographical study. *Int J Health Geogr*. 2008;7:20.
- Andersen ZJ, Kristiansen LC, Andersen KK, Olsen TS, Hvidberg M, Jensen SS, et al. Stroke and long-term exposure to outdoor air pollution from nitrogen dioxide: a cohort study. *Stroke*. 2012;43:320–325.
- Jerrett M, Burnett RT, Beckerman BS, Turner MC, Krewski D, Thurston G, et al. Spatial analysis of air pollution and mortality in California. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med*. 2013;188:593–599.
- Lipsett MJ, Ostro BD, Reynolds P, Goldberg D, Hertz A, Jerrett M, et al. Long-term exposure to air pollution and cardiorespiratory disease in the California teachers study cohort. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med*. 2011;184:828–835.
- Miller KA, Siscovick DS, Sheppard L, Shepherd K, Sullivan JH, Anderson GL, et al. Long-term exposure to air pollution and incidence of cardiovascular events in women. *N Engl J Med*. 2007;356:447–458.
- Ueda K, Nagasawa SY, Nitta H, Miura K, Ueshima H; NIPPON DATA80 Research Group. Exposure to particulate matter and long-term risk of cardiovascular mortality in Japan: NIPPON DATA80. *J Atheroscler Thromb*. 2012;19:246–254.
- Yorifuji T, Kashima S, Tsuda T, Ishikawa-Takata K, Ohta T, Tsuruta K, et al. Long-term exposure to traffic-related air pollution and the risk of death from hemorrhagic stroke and lung cancer in Shizuoka, Japan. *Sci Total Environ*. 2013;443:397–402.
- Atkinson RW, Carey IM, Kent AJ, van Staa TP, Anderson HR, Cook DG. Long-term exposure to outdoor air pollution and incidence of cardiovascular diseases. *Epidemiology*. 2013;24:44–53.
- Maheswaran R, Pearson T, Smeeton NC, Beevers SD, Campbell MJ, Wolfe CD. Outdoor air pollution and incidence of ischemic and hemorrhagic stroke: a small-area level ecological study. *Stroke*. 2012;43:22–27.
- Stafoggia M, Cesaroni G, Peters A, Andersen ZJ, Badaloni C, Beelen R, et al. Long-Term Exposure to Ambient Air Pollution and Incidence of Cerebrovascular Events: Results from 11 European Cohorts within the ESCAPE Project. *Environ Health Perspect*. 2014;122:919–925.
- Oudin A, Stroh E, Strömberg U, Jakobsson K, Björk J. Long-term exposure to air pollution and hospital admissions for ischemic stroke. A register-based case-control study using modelled NO(x) as exposure proxy. *BMC Public Health*. 2009;9:301.
- Oudin A, Strömberg U, Jakobsson K, Stroh E, Lindgren AG, Norrving B, et al. Hospital admissions for ischemic stroke: does long-term exposure to air pollution interact with major risk factors? *Cerebrovasc Dis*. 2011;31:284–293.
- Johnson JY, Rowe BH, Villeneuve PJ. Ecological analysis of long-term exposure to ambient air pollution and the incidence of stroke in Edmonton, Alberta, Canada. *Stroke*. 2010;41:1319–1325.
- Sørensen M, Lühndorf P, Ketzler M, Andersen ZJ, Tjønneland A, Overvad K, et al. Combined effects of road traffic noise and ambient air pollution in relation to risk for stroke? *Environ Res*. 2014;133:49–55.
- Johnson JY, Rowe BH, Allen RW, Peters PA, Villeneuve PJ. A case-control study of medium-term exposure to ambient nitrogen dioxide pollution and hospitalization for stroke. *BMC Public Health*. 2013;13:368.
- Chen R, Zhang Y, Yang C, Zhao Z, Xu X, Kan H. Acute effect of ambient air pollution on stroke mortality in the China air pollution and health effects study. *Stroke*. 2013;44:954–960.
- Hoek G, Brunekreef B, Fischer P, van Wijnen J. The association between air pollution and heart failure, arrhythmia, embolism, thrombosis, and other cardiovascular causes of death in a time series study. *Epidemiology*. 2001;12:355–357.
- Hong YC, Lee JT, Kim H, Kwon HJ. Air pollution: a new risk factor in ischemic stroke mortality. *Stroke*. 2002;33:2165–2169.
- Hong YC, Lee JT, Kim H, Ha EH, Schwartz J, Christiani DC. Effects of air pollutants on acute stroke mortality. *Environ Health Perspect*. 2002;110:187–191.
- Kan H, Jia J, Chen B. Acute stroke mortality and air pollution: new evidence from Shanghai, China. *J Occup Health*. 2003;45:321–323.
- Kettunen J, Lanki T, Tiittanen P, Aalto PP, Koskentalo T, Kulmala M, et al. Associations of fine and ultrafine particulate air pollution with stroke mortality in an area of low air pollution levels. *Stroke*. 2007;38:918–922.
- Li G, Zhou M, Cai Y, Zhang Y, Pan X. Does temperature enhance acute mortality effects of ambient particle pollution in Tianjin City, China. *Sci Total Environ*. 2011;409:1811–1817.
- Qian Z, He Q, Lin HM, Kong L, Liao D, Dan J, et al. Association of daily cause-specific mortality with ambient particle air pollution in Wuhan, China. *Environ Res*. 2007;105:380–389.

30. Qian Z, He Q, Lin HM, Kong L, Liao D, Yang N, et al. Short-term effects of gaseous pollutants on cause-specific mortality in Wuhan, China. *J Air Waste Manag Assoc.* 2007;57:785–793.
31. Qian Z, He Q, Lin HM, Kong L, Bentley CM, Liu W, et al. High temperatures enhanced acute mortality effects of ambient particle pollution in the “oven” city of Wuhan, China. *Environ Health Perspect.* 2008;116:1172–1178.
32. Qian Z, Lin HM, Stewart WF, Kong L, Xu F, Zhou D, et al. Seasonal pattern of the acute mortality effects of air pollution. *J Air Waste Manag Assoc.* 2010;60:481–488.
33. Turin TC, Kita Y, Rumana N, Nakamura Y, Ueda K, Takashima N, et al. Ambient air pollutants and acute case-fatality of cerebro-cardiovascular events: Takashima Stroke and AMI Registry, Japan (1988-2004). *Cerebrovasc Dis.* 2012;34:130–139.
34. Yorifuji T, Kawachi I, Sakamoto T, Doi H. Associations of outdoor air pollution with hemorrhagic stroke mortality. *J Occup Environ Med.* 2011;53:124–126.
35. Yorifuji T, Kashima S. Associations of particulate matter with stroke mortality: a multicity study in Japan. *J Occup Environ Med.* 2013;55:768–771.
36. Zanobetti A, Schwartz J. The effect of fine and coarse particulate air pollution on mortality: a national analysis. *Environ Health Perspect.* 2009;117:898–903.
37. Maynard D, Coull BA, Gryparis A, Schwartz J. Mortality risk associated with short-term exposure to traffic particles and sulfates. *Environ Health Perspect.* 2007;115:751–755.
38. Qian Y, Zhu M, Cai B, Yang Q, Kan H, Song G, et al. Epidemiological evidence on association between ambient air pollution and stroke mortality. *J Epidemiol Community Health.* 2013;67:635–640.
39. Ren C, Melly S, Schwartz J. Modifiers of short-term effects of ozone on mortality in eastern Massachusetts—a case-crossover analysis at individual level. *Environ Health.* 2010;9:3.
40. Zeka A, Zanobetti A, Schwartz J. Short term effects of particulate matter on cause specific mortality: effects of lags and modification by city characteristics. *Occup Environ Med.* 2005;62:718–725.
41. Zeka A, Zanobetti A, Schwartz J. Individual-level modifiers of the effects of particulate matter on daily mortality. *Am J Epidemiol.* 2006;163:849–859.
42. Lokken RP, Wellenius GA, Coull BA, Burger MR, Schlaug G, Suh HH, et al. Air pollution and risk of stroke: underestimation of effect due to misclassification of time of event onset. *Epidemiology.* 2009;20:137–142.
43. Ballester F, Tenías JM, Pérez-Hoyos S. Air pollution and emergency hospital admissions for cardiovascular diseases in Valencia, Spain. *J Epidemiol Community Health.* 2001;55:57–65.
44. Burnett RT, Smith-Doiron M, Stieb D, Cakmak S, Brook JR. Effects of particulate and gaseous air pollution on cardiorespiratory hospitalizations. *Arch Environ Health.* 1999;54:130–139.
45. Chan CC, Chuang KJ, Chien LC, Chen WJ, Chang WT. Urban air pollution and emergency admissions for cerebrovascular diseases in Taipei, Taiwan. *Eur Heart J.* 2006;27:1238–1244.
46. Corea F, Silvestrelli G, Baccarelli A, Giua A, Previdi P, Siliprandi G, et al. Airborne pollutants and lacunar stroke: a case cross-over analysis on stroke unit admissions. *Neurol Int.* 2012;4:e11.
47. Jalaludin B, Morgan G, Lincoln D, Sheppard V, Simpson R, Corbett S. Associations between ambient air pollution and daily emergency department attendances for cardiovascular disease in the elderly (65+ years), Sydney, Australia. *J Expo Sci Environ Epidemiol.* 2006;16:225–237.
48. Larrieu S, Jusot JF, Blanchard M, Prouvost H, Declercq C, Fabre P, et al. Short term effects of air pollution on hospitalizations for cardiovascular diseases in eight French cities: the PSAS program. *Sci Total Environ.* 2007;387:105–112.
49. Le Tertre A, Medina S, Samoli E, Forsberg B, Michelozzi P, Boumghar A, et al. Short-term effects of particulate air pollution on cardiovascular diseases in eight European cities. *J Epidemiol Community Health.* 2002;56:773–779.
50. Linn WS, Szlachcic Y, Gong H Jr, Kinney PL, Berhane KT. Air pollution and daily hospital admissions in metropolitan Los Angeles. *Environ Health Perspect.* 2000;108:427–434.
51. Moolgavkar SH. Air pollution and hospital admissions for diseases of the circulatory system in three U.S. metropolitan areas. *J Air Waste Manag Assoc.* 2000;50:1199–1206.
52. Nascimento LF, Francisco JB, Patto MB, Antunes AM. Environmental pollutants and stroke-related hospital admissions. *Cad Saude Publica.* 2012;28:1319–1324.
53. Poloniecki JD, Atkinson RW, de Leon AP, Anderson HR. Daily time series for cardiovascular hospital admissions and previous day’s air pollution in London, UK. *Occup Environ Med.* 1997;54:535–540.
54. Pönkä A, Virtanen M. Low-level air pollution and hospital admissions for cardiac and cerebrovascular diseases in Helsinki. *Am J Public Health.* 1996;86:1273–1280.
55. Sunyer J, Ballester F, Tertre AL, Atkinson R, Ayres JG, Forastiere F, et al. The association of daily sulfur dioxide air pollution levels with hospital admissions for cardiovascular diseases in Europe (The Aphea-II study). *Eur Heart J.* 2003;24:752–760.
56. Turin TC, Kita Y, Rumana N, Nakamura Y, Ueda K, Takashima N, et al. Short-term exposure to air pollution and incidence of stroke and acute myocardial infarction in a Japanese population. *Neuroepidemiology.* 2012;38:84–92.
57. Villeneuve PJ, Chen L, Stieb D, Rowe BH. Associations between outdoor air pollution and emergency department visits for stroke in Edmonton, Canada. *Eur J Epidemiol.* 2006;21:689–700.
58. Villeneuve PJ, Johnson JY, Pasichnyk D, Lowes J, Kirkland S, Rowe BH. Short-term effects of ambient air pollution on stroke: who is most vulnerable? *Sci Total Environ.* 2012;430:193–201.
59. Wong TW, Lau TS, Yu TS, Neller A, Wong SL, Tam W, et al. Air pollution and hospital admissions for respiratory and cardiovascular diseases in Hong Kong. *Occup Environ Med.* 1999;56:679–683.
60. Wordley J, Walters S, Ayres JG. Short term variations in hospital admissions and mortality and particulate air pollution. *Occup Environ Med.* 1997;54:108–116.
61. Xiang H, Mertz KJ, Arena VC, Brink LL, Xu X, Bi Y, et al. Estimation of short-term effects of air pollution on stroke hospital admissions in Wuhan, China. *PLoS One.* 2013;8:e61168.
62. Xu X, Sun Y, Ha S, Talbot EO, Lissaker CT. Association between ozone exposure and onset of stroke in Allegheny County, Pennsylvania, USA, 1994-2000. *Neuroepidemiology.* 2013;41:2–6.
63. Yang CY, Chen YS, Chiu HF, Goggins WB. Effects of Asian dust storm events on daily stroke admissions in Taipei, Taiwan. *Environ Res.* 2005;99:79–84.
64. Tsai SS, Goggins WB, Chiu HF, Yang CY. Evidence for an association between air pollution and daily stroke admissions in Kaohsiung, Taiwan. *Stroke.* 2003;34:2612–2616.
65. Wellenius GA, Schwartz J, Mittleman MA. Air pollution and hospital admissions for ischemic and hemorrhagic stroke among medicare beneficiaries. *Stroke.* 2005;36:2549–2553.
66. Lisabeth LD, Escobar JD, Dvorchak JT, Sánchez BN, Majersik JJ, Brown DL, et al. Ambient air pollution and risk for ischemic stroke and transient ischemic attack. *Ann Neurol.* 2008;64:53–59.
67. O’Donnell MJ, Fang J, Mittleman MA, Kapral MK, Wellenius GA; Investigators of the Registry of Canadian Stroke Network. Fine particulate air pollution (PM_{2.5}) and the risk of acute ischemic stroke. *Epidemiology.* 2011;22:422–431.
68. Wellenius GA, Burger MR, Coull BA, Schwartz J, Suh HH, Koutrakis P, et al. Ambient air pollution and the risk of acute ischemic stroke. *Arch Intern Med.* 2012;172:229–234.
69. Henrotin JB, Besancenot JP, Bejot Y, Giroud M. Short-term effects of ozone air pollution on ischaemic stroke occurrence: a case-crossover analysis from a 10-year population-based study in Dijon, France. *Occup Environ Med.* 2007;64:439–445.
70. Henrotin JB, Zeller M, Lorgis L, Cottin Y, Giroud M, Béjot Y. Evidence of the role of short-term exposure to ozone on ischaemic cerebral and cardiac events: the Dijon Vascular Project (DIVA). *Heart.* 2010;96:1990–1996.
71. Yamazaki S, Nitta H, Ono M, Green J, Fukuhara S. Intracerebral haemorrhage associated with hourly concentration of ambient particulate matter: case-crossover analysis. *Occup Environ Med.* 2007;64:17–24.
72. Bedada GB, Smith CJ, Tyrrell PJ, Hirst AA, Agius R. Short-term effects of ambient particulates and gaseous pollutants on the incidence of transient ischaemic attack and minor stroke: a case-crossover study. *Environ Health.* 2012;11:77.
73. Yang WS, Wang X, Deng Q, Fan WY, Wang WY. An evidence-based appraisal of global association between air pollution and risk of stroke. *Int J Cardiol.* 2014;175:307–313.
74. Pope CA III, Ezzati M, Dockery DW. Fine-particulate air pollution and life expectancy in the United States. *N Engl J Med.* 2009;360:376–386.

KEY WORDS: air pollution ■ environmental medicine ■ epidemiology ■ particulate matter ■ stroke